COLLOQUIA: ARGUMENTATION II
HOW DO WE EFFECTIVELY USE EVIDENCE TO CREATE MEANINGFUL ARGUMENTS?

March 20, 2019

Dixie J. Grupe
Social Studies Director
Office of College and Career Readiness
Missouri Department of Elementary and Secondary Education
All students will graduate ready for success.

Access, Opportunity, Equity

Teachers and Leaders

Efficiency and Effectiveness
CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT SYSTEM

THEORY OF ACTION:
Improved student learning for every student in every school.

- Collaborative Climate and Culture
- Effective Teaching and Learning
- Data-Based Decision Making
- Leadership
- Alignment of Standards, Curriculum and Assessment
1. How did it feel to be in a center circle?

2. How did it feel to be on the outside of a circle?

3. How did you feel about those with you in the center?

4. How did you feel about those outside the circle where you were?

5. Who did not make a trip into the circle? How did that feel?

How does this experience connect with ideas of access, opportunity, and equity for all our students?
Today's Agenda:
3/20/2019

I. Welcome and introductions
II. Social Studies and “Access, Opportunity and Equity”
III. What’s going on with Elementary Social Studies?
IV. Educator Products and Social Science Thinking Skills
V. Anchor Experience: An Elementary Mystery
VI. Model Lesson
VII. Lunch
VIII. DESE Updates
IX. Featured Social Scientist: Dr. Sandy Davidson, Ph.D., J.D., Curators’ Teaching Professor at the University of Missouri School of Journalism and Adjunct Professor at the University of Missouri School of Law

Supreme Blunders

Next Year....

“I heeded your advice about not saying anything controversial. I had no idea that some people could be offended by the word ‘welcome!’”
CCSSO's Social Studies Collaborative has been exploring ways to address the marginalization of social studies at the elementary level. Members hold that dedicated time for social studies is a requisite for overcoming curricular inequities that impact student achievement and abilities to engage effectively in civic life.

In June of 2018, literacy researcher Nell K. Duke (University of Michigan) presented to the Social Studies Collaborative. Professor Duke shared research on how social studies supports literacy development, and urged the social studies and literacy communities to become allies in the causes of social studies and literacy achievement.

In this video, invited by the CCSSO Social Studies Collaborative, Professor Duke makes her case for greater time for social studies and science.

https://youtu.be/LAWO2lvAnjI
The Marginalization of Social Studies

Research consistently demonstrates that social studies receives the least amount of instructional time in the elementary grades when compared to the amount of time afforded to other core content areas.

College, Career, and Civic Life

Students are denied opportunities to succeed in college, career, and civic life when social studies is marginalized.

44% of districts surveyed have reduced time for social studies since the enactment of No Child Left Behind.

Civic Engagement

Preparation for civic life was the primary purpose for establishing public schools in the United States. Students who receive effective social studies instruction are:

- More likely to vote and discuss politics at home.
- Four times more likely to volunteer and work on community issues.
- More confident in their ability to speak publicly and communicate with their elected representatives.

23% of American 8th graders are proficient in civics, according to the most recent NAEP assessment.

An Issue of Equity for All Students

Reading

Content knowledge makes weak readers better readers.

Reading assessments require background knowledge from social studies disciplines like civics, economics, geography, and history.

Poor readers with strong background knowledge display better reading comprehension than strong readers with low background knowledge.

2nd graders who had 60 lessons of literacy-rich social studies instruction scored 23% higher on reading assessments.

TIME SPENT ON CORE ELEMENTARY SUBJECTS

- English: 53.40%
- Mathematics: 21.32%
- Social Studies: 10.69%
- Science: 10.60%

U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics, Schools and Staffing Survey (SASS)

What to do?

- Dedicate at least 45 minutes of daily instructional time to social studies in grades K-5.
- Assess social studies skills and content.
- Support social studies professional learning.
- Use high-quality social studies curriculum and materials.
What is “high quality social studies curriculum”?  

- **Curriculum** -- total of a child’s experience in school, “porous walls of school”  
- **Social Studies** -- about relationships -- includes important content and behaviors  
- **High Quality** --  
  - Begins with everyday life...what do students already know and do?  
  - Focuses on conceptual ideas...Ideas about something, not lists of facts  
  - Highlights ‘human agency—what enables people to take actions, what restricts people from taking action  
  - Integrates content within Social Studies disciplines and between other content areas  

- **Requires**: sustained time, building on student interests, administrative support, teacher autonomy
IDEAS ABOUT SOME CONCEPT, IDEAL, GOAL, AND INTEREST OF VALUE TO OUR STUDENTS—NOT LISTING OF FACTS

MLS Standards: not much at “remember” level
WHAT IS SOCIAL SCIENCE THINKING?

- It is what we know about our lives and our world, but also how we know it.

- It is understanding patterns and processes which occur across time and place and applying that understanding to new or novel circumstances.

- It is communicating that knowledge accurately, and creating meaning from that knowledge.
MLS EXPECTATIONS FOR K-12 SOCIAL STUDIES HAVE ONLY A VERY FEW “REMEMBER“ LEVEL STANDARDS. MANY REQUIRE STUDENTS TO MOVE TOWARD ARGUMENTATION.

**Remember**

- “Recite the Pledge of Allegiance” (Kindergarten)
- “Name and locate major cities, rivers, regions and border states of Missouri” (Grade 3)
- “Locate major nations of the world” (6-8 Geography)
- ??? 9-12 Government

**Understand, Apply, Analyze, Evaluate, Create**

- “Describe how you and your family remember and commemorate your cultural heritage.” (Kindergarten)
- “Explain how geography affected important events in Missouri history.” (Grade 3)
- “Analyze how the physical and human characteristics of current world regions are connected to changing identity and culture.” (6-8 Geography)
- “Evaluate the extent to which decisions made in the Constitutional Convention were influenced by previous models of government and experiences under British Rule.” (9-12 Government)
How do we create high quality teaching and learning opportunities for all our students based on the 2016 MLS Expectations for Social Studies?

"That was an awesome worksheet," said no student ever.
WHAT DO THESE MLS EXPECTATIONS MEAN FOR HIGH QUALITY TEACHING, LEARNING AND ASSESSMENT?

In planning for great thinking in Social Studies, there are SIX essential elements,

- Meaningful content tied to MLS
- Reading
- Writing
- Speaking
- Listening
- Social Science Thinking Skill
Assessment resources developed by Missouri educators
- Fully aligned with MLS Expectations for Social Studies grades 3-8
- Rooted in reading and writing with complex social studies texts
- Built on critical thinking skills used in social studies thinking
- Managed and used locally (teacher, building, district)
- Benchmark tool: meaningful, timely information for teachers about student performance
- Designed to scaffold and support meaning teaching and learning in Missouri Social Studies
- Parallel in focus and tasks with high school EOCs
- Available when?

NOT a year-end, grade-level assessment
NOT used to collect state data
NOT managed or scheduled by DESE

"If you want a better answer, ask a better question!"
WHAT WILL THESE ASSESSMENT RESOURCE PACKETS LOOK LIKE?

Prototype version:

- Begins with standard(s) assessed
- Cover page:
  - Assessment overview
  - Teacher notes
  - Brief content context
- Question types:
  - Multiple Choice
  - Multi-select
  - Technology enhanced
  - Constructed Response

NOT RECALL OR REMEMBER

Process and Timetable:

- Design, Blueprints: Fall 2018
- Initial Item writing: February 5-8, 2019
- Content and Bias: June 17-20, 2019
- Pilot: Fall 2019?
- Round II Item Writing and C&B: Fall 2019?
- Available.....Spring Semester 2020?
- Interested?
WHAT DO THESE MLS EXPECTATIONS MEAN FOR HIGH QUALITY TEACHING, LEARNING AND ASSESSMENT?

In planning for great thinking in Social Studies, there are SIX essential elements,

✓ Meaningful content tied to MLS
✓ Reading
✓ Writing
✓ Speaking
✓ Listening

✓ Social Science Thinking Skill
## Social Science Thinking Skills

### I. Chronological Reasoning

1. **Historical Causation**
   - Compare causes and/or effects, including between short- and long-term effects.
   - Analyze and evaluate the interaction of multiple causes and/or effects.
   - Assess historical contingency by distinguishing among coincidence, causation, and correlation, as well as critiquing existing interpretations of cause and effect.

2. **Patterns of Continuity & Change Over Time**
   - Analyze and evaluate historical patterns of continuity and change over time.
   - Connect patterns of continuity and change over time to larger historical processes or themes.

3. **Periodization**
   - Explain ways that historical events and processes can be organized within blocks of time.
   - Analyze and evaluate competing models of history.

### II. Comparison & Contextualization

4. **Comparison**
   - Compare related historical developments and processes across place, time, and/or different societies within one society.
   - Explain and evaluate multiple and differing perspectives on a given historical phenomenon.

5. **Contextualization**
   - Explain and evaluate ways in which specific historical phenomena, events, or processes connect to broader regional, national, or global processes occurring at the same time.
   - Explain and evaluate ways in which a phenomenon, event, or process connects to other, similar historical phenomena across time.

### III. Crafting Historical Arguments from Historical Evidence

6. **Historical Argumentation**
   - Analyze commonly accepted historical arguments and explain how an argument has been constructed from historical evidence.
   - Construct convincing interpretations through analysis of disparate, relevant historical evidence.
   - Evaluate and synthesize conflicting historical evidence to construct persuasive historical arguments.

7. **Appropriate Use of Historical Evidence**
   - Analyze features of historical evidence such as audience, purpose, point of view, format, argument, limitations, and context germane to the evidence considered.
   - Based on analysis and evaluation of historical evidence, make supportable inferences and draw appropriate conclusions.

### IV. Historical Interpretations & Synthesis

8. **Interpretation**
   - Analyze diverse historical interpretations.
   - Evaluate how historians’ perspectives influence their interpretations and how models of historical interpretation change over time.

9. **Synthesis**
   - Combine disparate, sometimes contradictory evidence from primary sources and secondary works in order to create a persuasive understanding of the past.
   - Apply insights about the past to other historical contexts or circumstances, including the present.
## What Questions Do We Ask of the Past?

**Thinking Like a Historian**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cause and Effect</th>
<th>Change and Continuity</th>
<th>Turning Points</th>
<th>Using the Past</th>
<th>Through Their Eyes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What were the causes of past events?</td>
<td>What has changed?</td>
<td>How did past decisions or actions affect future choices?</td>
<td>How does the past help us make sense of the present?</td>
<td>How did people in the past view their world?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What were the effects?</td>
<td>What has remained the same?</td>
<td>How did decisions or actions narrow or eliminate choices for people?</td>
<td>How is the past similar to the present?</td>
<td>How did their worldview affect their choices and actions?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Who or what made change happen?</td>
<td>• Who has benefited from this change?</td>
<td>• How did decisions or actions significantly transform people’s lives?</td>
<td>• How is the past different from the present?</td>
<td>• What values, skills and forms of knowledge did people need to succeed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Who supported change?</td>
<td>• Who has not benefited? And why?</td>
<td></td>
<td>• What can we learn from the past?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Argumentation*
In the passage, which of the following most directly argues...
This statement strongly suggests that...
The main purpose of the information in lines....
Which of the following statements best describes the author’s claim that...
Which of the following statements best describes a valid counter argument to....

Causation*
How is ____ an example of _____?
What evidence supports ____?
Based on the information in the text, what do you think...?
What can you infer about ____ from the information in _____?
According to the text, what is the reason for...?
The text/article/picture cites all of the following as causes of ____ EXCEPT....
Is X an example of causation or correlation? Defend your answer using information from the texts provided.

Comparison*
How is ____ related to _____?
What are the similarities between?
How is _____ similar/different from _____?
Which of the following best explains why ____ is different from _____?
What accounts for the difference between X and Y?
What explains the similarity between X and Y
Which of the following best distinguishes.....?

Contextualization*
In the context of this passage, the statement suggests.....
The author of this _____ might have been influenced by____?
The event that most influenced the _____.
The following document might be biased against ____ because of ____?
This historical event/trend being alluded to in this source is most likely.
The events referenced in this ____ resulted in ____.
Continuity and Change*

How is this passage different from the popular culture from the decade before?

What were the causes of change illustrated in _____.
To what extent has the culture seen in this passage remained the same _________.
What accounts for the change illustrated in this text?
What accounts for the continuities expressed in this text?

Periodization*

Based on the information _______ this ___________ most likely represents which of the following ___________.

Based on the ________, in which decade was it produced? What evidence can you use to support your answer?

Perspective/Point of View*

In the context of this passage, this statement suggests _________________.

In the passage/image/etc., which of the following most directly argues...?

Which of the following statements best reflects X's point of view of this event?

*What evidence from the texts provided supports your answer?

* What evidence from your background knowledge supports your answer

* What additional texts/sources/documents would you like to add support to your answer?

Question Types:

Hot Text
Multiple Select
Fill in the Blank
Matching
Constructed Response
Drag and Drop
Multiple Passage
Sequencing/Timelines
In planning for great thinking in Social Studies, there are **SIX** essential elements,

- **Meaningful content tied to MLS**
  - Reading
  - Writing
  - Speaking
  - Listening
  - Social Science Thinking Skill
Anchor Experiences

• What learning experiences can I create to anchor the learning that is to come?

• How can I make this experience memorable, relevant, and applicable?

• Will this experience serve as a shorthand or touchstone?
What is the mystery?

HTTPS://WWW.YOUTUBE.COM/WATCH?V=0EUGKDULZC6I
Cold Case Mystery:

Missing Person: Viola Swamp?

It has been 42 years since Viola Swamp was last seen. It is our task to determine if there is probable cause to reopen the search for Viola Swamp.

There are two working theories in this case. Work with your table mates to sort through the evidence regarding the person of Viola Swamp, sort it in the appropriate column, and then determine which theory it supports. Next to each fact, write a statement which turns your fact from information to evidence next to each fact you identify.
Miss Nelson was nice, but Miss Swamp was a real witch.

This consistent difference in temperament was too complicated for one person. Miss Nelson never once acted mean and Miss Swamp never once acted nice. If they had been the same person, someone would have slipped up. People cannot fake their temperament over a long, long period of time.
WORKING WITH YOUR PARTNER/TEAM, CREATE AN ARGUMENT WHICH YOU CAN SUPPORT WITH EVIDENCE FROM THE STORY.

There are so many important personality differences between Miss Nelson and Miss Swamp, therefore they must be two different people.

Miss Nelson and Miss Swamp are the same person because Miss Nelson created a “substitute” to teach her students a lesson about better behavior.
What was this lesson really about?
What does it teach us about the difference between fact and evidence?
What does it teach us about creating or evaluating an argument?
What did you learn about using evidence to create an effective argument?
5.PC.1.B Apply the principles of the Bill of Rights to the historic time period studied and to current events. (Argumentation)

5.PC.1.D Analyze ways by which citizens have effectively voiced opinions, monitored government and brought about change both past and present. (Comparison)

5.H.3.I.a Identify the political, economic and social consequences of World War I and World War II on the United States.

5.TS.7.G Research and defend a point of view/position on a social studies question. (Argumentation)

Social Science Thinking Skills: Comparison and Argumentation (use of evidence)

IT ALWAYS BEGINS WITH THE STANDARDS
HTTPS://WWW.YOUTUBE.COM/WATCH?V=IlWDecB5uo
"In the future days, which we seek to make secure, we look forward to a world founded upon four essential human freedoms. The first is freedom of speech and expression—everywhere in the world. The second is freedom of every person to worship God in his own way—everywhere in the world. The third is freedom from want—which, translated into world terms, means economic understandings which will secure to every nation a healthy peacetime life for its inhabitants—everywhere in the world. The fourth is freedom from fear—which, translated into world terms, means a world-wide reduction of armaments to such a point and in such a thorough fashion that no nation will be in a position to commit an act of physical aggression against any neighbor—anywhere in the world. That is no vision of a distant millennium. It is a definite basis for a kind of world attainable in our own time and generation. That kind of world is the very antithesis of the so-called new order of tyranny which the dictators seek to create with the crash of a bomb."

--- FRANKLIN DELANO ROOSEVELT, 1941, STATE OF THE UNION ADDRESS
Maurice “Pops” Peterson said in a 2018 interview, there are still freedoms to fight for, “that people count, that people belong and that people have the right to be seen and heard.”

**Research Question:** What do you identify as a freedom people still have to fight for today?

**Working with your partner/team,**

1. Identify a freedom people still have to fight for today and be ready to explain your selection reasoning to your teacher.
2. Write and deliver a 3-4 minute speech that explains the importance of the fight for that right.
3. Create a visual representation of that fight including a metacognitive piece explaining your visual representation.
4. Write a poem or short story which speaks to the importance of that freedom.

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zhkoiCPo8gM&t=60s
https://www.popspeterson.com/pops-at-the-roosevelt-house
1. How do the ideals of access, equity and opportunity figure in your own life?

2. How do the ideals of access, equity and opportunity figure in your organization?

3. How do the ideals of access, equity and opportunity figure in the work you do with local districts?
DESE UPDATES

- Holocaust Commemoration 4/10/2019
- Gilder Lehman National History Teacher of the Year: Nominations due by 3/31
- Summer PD: Last two weeks in July
- USSYP Nomination forms available August 1, 2019
Government Field Test info:

- Purpose
- 5% tested
- Peak weeks April 23-May 17
- Window extended to June 3
- Govt Field test is NOT optional
- Optional American History Field test
- Item Writing Workshop in January
- Alignment Study March 27-29, 2019
- Content and Bias in June: Interested?
- Data Review and finalize forms July/August
- Observational feedback and suggestions
Historic, controversial, complex: Dred Scot, Myra Bradwell, Virginia Minor and thousands of native Americans...

Dr. Sandy Davidson, Ph.D. and J.D.

Curators’ Teaching Professor at the University of Missouri School of Journalism and Adjunct Professor at the University of Missouri School of Law
DESE UPDATES:

1. Send me your name and area of interest if you would like to participate in assessment development in the coming year.

2. Please respond to the email survey, I will be sending out in the next week as we make plans for next year’s Colloquia.

3. Anticipate info about DESE Summer PD (c. 7/22-8/2) in coming weeks.

4. Thanks for your time and drive safely 😊
Access, Opportunity and Equity

Here is my hope: each of us will seek to be a neighbor and create a neighborhood where each of our students can thrive.

HTTPS://WWW.YOUTUBE.COM/ WATCH?V=V AJ EHRO - TSW
Tell us what you think!

https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/OCCREvaluation